Thickness dependent effects of solubility and surface phenomena on the hydrogen transport properties of sputtered Pd77%Ag23% thin film membranes

Nicla Vicinanza a, Ingeborg-Helene Svenum a,c, Live Nova Næs b, Thijs A. Peters c, Rune Breidesen c, Anne Borg b, Hilde J. Venvik a,* 

a Department of Chemical Engineering, Norwegian University of Science and Technology, NO-7491 Trondheim, Norway 

b Department of Physics, Norwegian University of Science and Technology, NO-7491 Trondheim, Norway 

c SINTEF Materials and Chemistry, 0314 Oslo, Norway

1. Introduction

Palladium-based membranes are able to separate hydrogen from gaseous mixtures with high or perfect selectivity and high permeability [1]. However, pure Pd is subject to the α- to β - phase transition in the palladium—hydrogen system at T < 300 °C and P < 2 MPa, which causes the so-called hydrogen embrittlement. This is suppressed by alloying with other metals [2,3]. Alloying palladium with silver leads in addition to an increase of the hydrogen solubility [3–5], with a maximum permeability at approximately 23 wt% Ag [4].

Hydrogen permeation through a dense membrane generally follows the solution-diffusion mechanism, where Fick’s law of diffusion describes the mass transport given by

\[ J_{H_2} = \frac{P}{t} (p_1^n - p_2^n). \]  

(1)

where \( P \) is the permeability of the membrane, \( t \) the thickness and \( p_1 \) and \( p_2 \) the partial pressure of hydrogen on the high and low pressure side of the membrane, respectively. The \( n \)-value is a number between 0.5 and 1, depending on the transport limiting step. The solution-diffusion mechanism defines the permeability \( P \) as the product of the diffusivity \( D \) and the solubility or Sieverts’ constant \( K \) given by

\[ P = DK. \]  

(2)

The diffusion of hydrogen is an activated process and the diffusivity is hence given by

\[ D = D_0 \exp(-E_a/RT). \]  

(3)

Here, \( D_0 \) is a pre-exponential factor, \( E_a \) is the activation energy for diffusion, \( T \) is the temperature and \( R \) is the gas constant.

The solubility of hydrogen in palladium (Pd) and Pd-based alloys can be described by Sieverts’ law, where the concentration of atomic hydrogen in the metal is proportional to the square root of the hydrogen partial pressure at constant temperature [6]. Dilute solution of hydrogen in the metal and no interactions between hydrogen atoms are assumed. Burch and Francis [7] observed that deviations from Sieverts’ law in pure palladium occur at temperatures lower than 250 °C and atomic ratios (H/Pd) of hydrogen to palladium above 0.006. According to Evans [8], Sieverts’ law is not obeyed at high pressure (\( > 13.33 \) kPa) as the concentration of absorbed hydrogen in palladium increases. Validation of Sieverts’ law has been shown at low hydrogen content [6,8–10]. Both the solubility and the diffusivity

* Corresponding author. Tel.: +47 73592831. 
E-mail address: hilde.j.venvik@ntnu.com (H.J. Venvik).

http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.memsci.2014.11.031 
0376-7388/© 2014 The Authors. Published by Elsevier B.V. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/3.0/).
of hydrogen in palladium depend on the temperature. While the diffusivity is enhanced by increasing temperature, the solubility decreases. Sieverts demonstrated that one volume of palladium is able to absorb up to 800 atmospheric volumes of hydrogen at 20 °C, while only 56 volumes at 140 °C [6]. The hydrogen solubility increases with silver content and reaches a maximum at 20–40% Ag [21–14], while the diffusion coefficient decreases [4,13,14]. The simultaneous changes in solubility and diffusivity lead to a value of permeability ~1.7 times higher for alloys with 23 wt% Ag than for pure Pd at 350 °C [15,16]. Different measurement principles can be applied to determine hydrogen solubility in palladium and its alloys [17], of which volumetric [18–20] and gravimetric [21–23] absorption, sample dilation measurements [24] and electrical resistance measurements [25] are a few examples. Flanagan and Oates [26] reported a series of methods used to estimate diffusivity in the palladium–hydrogen system.

The permeation through PdAg membranes is hence a combined kinetic and thermodynamic property [13]. Given that thin, defect-/pinhole-free membranes can be manufactured, the picture becomes further complicated at the point where surface phenomena affect the transport, and even more so if the thin Pd membrane is supported by a porous mechanical support material that may also impose transport limitations. The Pd-alloy membrane fabrication technique developed by SINTEF utilizing magnetron sputtering [27,28] has enabled membrane investigations with thicknesses down to 1 μm without defects, i.e., 100% selectivity, and in configurations where mass transfer limitations in the gas phase can be largely reduced [20–31]. We have previously presented results that indicate that the surface as well as the bulk microstructure and composition of the Pd77%Ag23% membranes affect the permeation, and that this may be affected by membrane treatment [32–34]. Previous investigations also indicate that – depending on the conditions and the pre-treatment of the membrane – surface limitations start to affect the permeation for thicknesses below ~5 μm [36–39]. The so-called heat treatment in air, essentially an oxidation–reduction cycle of the surface to a ~2 nm thick oxide [35], has been demonstrated to enhance the hydrogen transport kinetics [19,20,32–35,40–45] as well as to suppress the competitive adsorption of CO [44]. The findings have been linked to segregation phenomena [35,42,43,46] as well as roughening of the surface [19,32,35,47,48] and removal of surface impurities [42,43,49], but are not fully understood. However, the heat treatment in air is not expected to affect hydrogen solubility in Pd–Ag membranes [19,20].

The aim of this work is to further disentangle the interplay between the bulk solubility and diffusion and the surface phenomena in thin Pd77%Ag23% membranes, taking into account account structural properties. The solubility has been experimentally obtained as a function of temperature, and for different membrane thicknesses. Permeation measurements have been performed in a microchannel configuration with insignificant limitations to the mass transfer from the gas phase to the surface of the membrane [20–31]. When applied jointly with solubility and characterization data, this allows for an improved analysis of the phenomena affecting the hydrogen transport.

2. Materials and methods

2.1. Membranes and hydrogen permeation

Pd77%Ag23% thin films were prepared at SINTEF by a unique two-steps sputtering technique [27,28], to nominal thicknesses ranging from 2.2 to 10.0 μm. The resulting thicknesses of the samples were measured by white-light interferometry. The thin films were peeled off the Si substrate wafer applied during sputtering and sealed in a microchannel configuration made of a polished stainless steel feed housing with seven parallel channels, a stainless steel permeate housing, and a polished stainless steel plate [29]. The steel plate had apertures for gas flow corresponding to a total active surface area of 0.91 cm², determined by the feed housing geometry. The membrane growth side from the sputtering process was always placed facing the feed housing of the apparatus, while the side that faced the substrate always faced the permeate side. The permeation measurements were performed at 300, 350 and 400 °C. 300 °C was reached by ramping at 2 °C/min under nitrogen (purity 99.999%) flow on the feed side and argon (purity 99.999%) on the permeate. No sweep gas was used during hydrogen (purity 99.999%) permeation tests. The permeate side was kept at atmospheric pressure while a differential pressure was applied reaching a maximum of 200 kPa. Permeate flow was measured accurately by using a film flow meter. A Micro-GC (Agilent) was applied to check for potential failure/leakage by feeding N₂ and using Ar permeate sweep. No experiments or membranes indicative of N₂ leakage have been included in the results.

2.2. Characterization

Equilibrium sorption measurements were carried out using an ASAP 2020 Chemisorption Analyzer (Micromeritics Instrument Corporation). Prior to any sorption measurement, a degassing procedure was performed in order to clean the sample surfaces from unwanted species. Following heating under He and evacuation, volumetric hydrogen sorption measurements were performed applying hydrogen pressures from 0.02 to 90.7 kPa. Hydrogen was always introduced to the system at 300 °C. In every measurement a sample mass close to 0.1 g (Mettler Toledo XA204 Delta Range Analytical Balance) of the as-grown PdAg film peeled off the substrate was used. The sorption measurements were carried out twice for each sample at each temperature: 300, 350 and 400 °C. Samples with thicknesses in the range 2.2–11.2 μm were investigated. The weight of the membranes was carefully checked after each sorption experiment, since the degassing procedure can cause a reduction in the mass. This sample weight was used to calculate the adsorbed volume of hydrogen per mass unit.

Atomic force microscopy (AFM) imaging was carried out using a Bruker Multimode AFI instrument with a Veeco Multimode controller in tapping mode under atmospheric conditions. The surface topography was investigated for both the growth/feed side and the substrate/permeate side of as-grown samples. At least five areas at different locations on the surface for each sample were imaged. The first flattening order command, provided by the Nanoscope Software (Version 7.2, by Veeco), was performed in order to remove tilt and noise from all images. The surface topography was quantified by determining the root mean square roughness (Rq) from the recorded images.

3. Results and discussion

3.1. Hydrogen solubility

A representative example of the measured equilibrium hydrogen sorption isotherms is shown in Fig. 1 for the 6.9 μm thick membrane. Linear fitting including pressure points below ~200 Pa only, where Sieverts’ law is mainly valid [8], was performed to obtain Sieverts’ constant from the data. As shown (Fig. 1), there is little deviation between the two consecutive isotherms taken at each temperature, indicating negligible contributions from irreversible adsorption. Sieverts’ constants of the Pd77%Ag23% thin films as a function of the film thickness are shown in Fig. 2 for different temperatures. The solubility always decreases with increasing temperature and shows similar
temperature dependence for all membrane thicknesses. The difference in Sieverts’ constant is always larger in the temperature range 300–350 °C than 350–400 °C, in accordance with the thermodynamic temperature dependency of the hydrogen solubility.

More unexpectedly, however, Fig. 2 shows that the hydrogen solubility consistently decreases with increasing membrane thickness. Solubility as an intrinsic material property should not depend on thickness, and the experiment was therefore repeated several times and with different samples. Although minor differences in Sieverts’ constants were observed, the overall trend was always reproduced. Variations in hydrogen solubility in the Pd–Ag alloy membranes may be related to thickness dependent changes in the grain structure. Salomons et al. [21] attributed the enhancement of solubility in thin Pd-films to a strong influence of grain boundaries and increase of interface to volume ratio. The hydrogen uptake in palladium is also previously reported as dependent on the degree of grain boundary density, but with opposite effects for the α (increase) and β phase (decrease). Not only grain boundaries can affect hydrogen solubility but also other lattice defects such as voids, vacancies, dislocations and impurity atoms. Flanagan et al. [54] suggested that deviations from Sieverts’ law observed in their study could be attributed to hydrogen segregation in dislocations and vacancies. Moreover, going from the α to the β hydride phase (and vice versa) can also increase solubility [55], and this has been related to the large density of dislocations that the transformation generates [56,57]. The two-step sputtering technique used to obtain the Pd77% Ag23% membranes tested in this work avoids the presence of most potential contaminants, and analysis has confirmed the purity [27,28,34,35]. It is thus believed that impurities are not involved in the solubility variations found in the present work. Moreover, the composition (Pd–Ag) and experimental conditions applied have been chosen so as to avoid the phase transition. It has been established, however, that edge and screw dislocations are associated with the growth of the sputtered PdAg films, with twin lamellae present in the – mainly [111]-oriented – grains, but their dependency on grain size was not obtained [58]. Finally, it should be noted that our values for Sieverts’ constant obtained for the 11.2 μm membranes compare reasonably well to values obtained for even thicker, typically cold-rolled, membranes [13,20,59]. The different reports are given for comparable, but not exactly similar, compositions and temperatures, and in addition there seem to be minor variations reflecting e.g. structural differences. Nevertheless, our values obtained for the thinnest membranes seem consistently 10–30% higher.

In an effort to link the grain structure of the Pd77%Ag23% thin films to the measured solubility, atomic force microscopy (AFM) imaging was used. The topography studies show an increase in the surface roughness on the growth side as the thickness increases for as-grown thin films (Fig. 3). The substrate side is very smooth and characterized by small grains, as reported in Table 1. Increased roughness on the growth side with growing membrane thickness has already been reported for sputtered membranes similar to those applied here [32,35]. Images of the substrate side were previously not reported in literature due to the resolution limitations imposed by the equipment available at the time [32,35]. This was possible with the current AFM, and an image representative of the substrate side for all the samples is shown in Fig. 3(a).

Surface roughness can be associated with grain size; the larger the grains present in the film, the rougher the surface [60]. In consistence, Tucho et al. [34] measured grain size variations in similar, sputtered Pd77%Ag23% films using X-ray diffraction (XRD) and transmission electron microscopy (TEM). The grain sizes measured by TEM were obtained from cross-section samples at about 0.1–0.2 μm below the surface. The region near the substrate was characterized by small grains around 12–18 nm. The region near the growth side had larger grains. The grains were larger for the 10 μm film compared to the 5 μm film, with average grain sizes of 100 [34] and 76 nm, respectively [61].

The grain structure of the sputtered films reflects the growth process. Under the sputtering conditions applied, the nucleation density on the Si wafer substrate is high, and the smooth nature of the wafer surface also affects the resulting roughness on the substrate side. As more material is deposited, some grains grow while others are terminated and covered. The result is a grain size gradient extending from the substrate interface into the film, with elongated grains of preferential orientation along the [111] direction. This is schematically illustrated in Fig. 4. As a result, the average grain size increases with the thickness while the average density of grain boundaries decreases. There may exist a thickness after which further grain growth does not occur, but the average values will be affected somewhat beyond this thickness.

3.2. Hydrogen transport kinetics

The permeabilities obtained from the flux measurements, assuming n = 0.5, are given in Table 2. These are in good agreement with
values obtained for similarly prepared Pd77%Ag23% membranes not subjected to oxidation under air at elevated temperature or other pretreatment [32,33,45]. Eqs. (1) and (2) were combined to analyze the effect of thickness and temperature on the kinetics. Fig. 5 shows the measured permeances (P/kT, Eq. (1)) divided by the corresponding solubility (Sieverts) constants against the inverse thickness, applying a density of 11.674 g/cm³ for Pd77%Ag23%. It shows that the diffusivity/thickness (P/kT) systematically increases with temperature as expected. It also shows a reasonably linear dependence with 1/T for the thicknesses from 11.2 to 6.9 μm, indicating that bulk diffusion is controlling the transport. This is, however, not the case for the thinner membranes – with the leveling off of the values being a clear indication of surface phenomena becoming controlling. Through modeling, Ward and Dao predicted that hydrogen permeation through Pd membranes was bulk diffusion limited above 573 K and membrane thicknesses down to about 1 μm, whereas desorption became the limiting process for lower temperatures and/or thicknesses [62]. As discussed in Section 1, previous experimental findings show that the critical thickness for the transition between surface and bulk limited transport also depends on the pretreatment and the conditions [33,35–39].

Table 1
Root mean surface roughness for the as-grown thin film membranes as obtained from analyzing the recorded AFM images.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Samples thickness (μm)</th>
<th>Roughness (nm)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Growth/feed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>8.4 ± 0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>10.2 ± 0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>11.8 ± 1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>10.2 ± 0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>13.2 ± 2.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a Based on 5 × 5 μm² scan areas.
b Based on 1 × 1 μm² scan areas.

Table 2
Permeabilities for the different Pd77%Ag23% thin film membranes as measured at 300, 350, and 400 °C.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Thickness (μm)</th>
<th>Permeability (10⁻⁸ mol m⁻² s⁻¹ Pa⁻⁰·⁵)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fig. 3. Representative AFM topographic images as-grown Pd77%Ag23% films. (a) 1 × 1 μm² scan area of the substrate/permeate side; (b)–(f) 5 × 5 μm² scan areas from the growth/feed side of film thickness: (b) 2.2; (c) 4.7; (d) 6.9; (e) 8.5; and (f) 11.2 μm. (a) is obtained from the 2.2 μm thick sample, but representative of the substrate side of all thicknesses.

Fig. 4. Schematic illustration of the grain distribution of thin Pd–Ag films grown on silicon as resulting from the magnetron sputtering.
The applicability of Eqs. (1) and (2) must hence be considered, since, the flux can no longer be assumed proportional to the difference between the square root of the partial pressures, i.e. \( n = 0.5 \) (1). In principle, surface kinetic control should be associated with \( n = 1 \), but many investigations find \( n \)-values between 0.5 and 1, indicating that the transport mechanism is more complicated, see e.g. [63,64] and references cited therein. In addition, precise determination of the \( n \)-dependence by fitting of experimental data has been shown to require a wide differential pressure range [29,45]. The diffusivities calculated using Eq. (2) were therefore plotted as a function of inverse temperature to obtain the diffusivity constant and the activation energy according to Eq. (3) for the three higher thicknesses only. The result is given in Fig. 6 and Table 3. \( D_0 \) in the range 1–2 \( \times 10^{-7} \) m\(^2\)/s and \( E_a \sim 19 \) kJ/mol are in good agreement with values of diffusivity reported by Holleck [13] for a thick (between 0.08 and 0.20 cm) Pd80%Ag20% membrane.

Whether the density of grain boundaries affect the diffusivity should be evaluated based on bulk-limited permeance data, i.e. in the thickness range >5 \( \mu \)m for the membranes and conditions applied here. If the above explanation on the thickness dependence of the solubility is adopted, our results indicate little or no effect of the thickness range on the transport. The literature is somewhat inconclusive with respect to the effect of grain boundaries and other lattice defects on the kinetics [51,65–67], likely reflecting the large microstructural variations possible in polycrystalline palladium and PdAg alloys. Mütschele and Kirchheim [51] reported values of the hydrogen diffusion coefficient in a single crystal Pd sample and in nano-crystalline Pd. The diffusivity of hydrogen in the Pd single crystal was independent of the hydrogen concentration. However, in the nano-crystalline Pd-sample, the hydrogen diffusivity changed with the hydrogen concentration in the material, i.e. increasing hydrogen pressure. Li and Cheng [69] attributed a decrease of the hydrogen diffusivity in very thin, pure Pd films relative to bulk Pd foil to lattice defects at grain boundaries. These experiments were conducted in a solution using electrochemical stripping at room temperature, and they also observed decreased solubility by electrochemical cycling. Comparing the present results to pure Pd investigations is complicated by the differences in phase behavior. The membrane micro- and nanostructures, as well as the purity and homogeneity of the alloy composition, are strongly affected by the membrane/film fabrication. In this respect, sputtering/evaporation, arc melting-cold rolling, and wet chemical techniques such as electroless plating are very different.

The sputtering applied here results in pure and dense membranes of homogeneous bulk composition [68–70], highly suitable for detailed investigations of how the structure affects the membrane properties. The film nucleation and growth scheme produces, however, a gradient with respect to grain size across the thickness of the film. Systematic variation of thickness in the range 2.2–11 \( \mu \)m thus renders a variation in the average grain boundary density that possibly leads to variations in the thermodynamic properties. Careful solubility measurements were required to pick up this effect. The study envisages that such variations need to be addressed in order to increase the precision in transport kinetics analysis.

### 4. Conclusions

The solubility of hydrogen in sputtered Pd–Ag thin membranes shows an increase with decreasing membrane thickness. In addition, the hydrogen permeability exhibits variations with membrane thickness. This may be accounted for mainly by surface limitations when the thickness decreases below 5 \( \mu \)m, while the changes in permeability for the thicker membranes result from differences in hydrogen solubility rather than hydrogen diffusivity. The systematic variation in solubility may be related to gradients in grain size over the sputtered Pd–Ag thin films, with a larger fraction of smaller grains and higher average density of grain boundaries as the thickness is reduced.

### Acknowledgment

The authors would like to acknowledge the financial support of the Research Council of Norway through the RENERGI Program (190779/ S60) and CLIMIT Program (215666/E20), and NTNU, SINTEF and Statoil ASA through the Gas Technology Centre NTNU-SINTEF. Dr. M. Stange is also gratefully acknowledged for the manufacturing of the Pd-alloy
[61] W.M. Tucho, R. Holmestad, J.C. Walmsley, NTNU, previously unpublished data.