Karen Patrick Knutsen

Dead on Arrival? Patricia Cornwell’s Andy Garcia Series

Introduction
In 1990, Patricia Cornwell made her debut in crime fiction with her first Kay Scarpetta novel, Postmortem. Scarpetta was one of the first crime heroines who worked as a forensic pathologist, and Cornwell was able to draw on her own career as a crime reporter and her six-year stint working in a morgue to create her fictional world. The popularity of the ten-book Scarpetta series made her the number one best-selling female crime writer in the United States in the 1990s.

The Scarpetta novels were popular because of their fascinating forensic details and feminist sub-text. Cornwell created a heroine who is exaggeratedly exceptional. Kay Scarpetta is beautiful, but she is also a qualified forensic pathologist, criminal lawyer and expert witness. She does academic research and whips up gourmet meals in her spare time. Yet she is still only in her early forties. The fact that Scarpetta works as heroine for most readers, in spite of her superhuman qualities, says a lot about how women’s roles have changed in the past decades. Most readers were pleased with the role reversal: an empowered woman leading the battle against evil. Furthermore, Cornwell thematizes gay rights in her first series, since Kay’s beloved niece Lucy gradually grows to accept her gay identity. Although Kay sympathizes with her niece, she tends to focus on the problematic aspects of a gay lifestyle, and the Scarpetta novels thus remain fully anchored within the conservative, patriarchal worldview of the classic crime genre.

Many avid Cornwell fans were both puzzled and disappointed by her newest project, which several bookshop websites have dubbed her “Andy Garcia” series. So far this series comprises Hornet’s Nest, Southern Cross, and Isle of Dogs; all police procedurals in an ironic vein, verging on the
farcical. The first two novels focus on three characters: Police Chief Judy Hammer of Charlotte, North Carolina, her Deputy Chief, Virginia West, and rookie reporter/volunteer cop Andy Garcia. In the second novel, the trio move on to continue their campaign against crime in Richmond, Virginia. In *Isle of Dogs*, Andy Garcia takes the lead role as “Trooper Truth”. Judy Hammer is reduced to an almost minor character, and Virginia West disappears completely.

One reader characterized *Hornet’s Nest* as “DOA [...] one of the worst books I have read in a long time [...] with characters that never quite work [...] a plot that lacks focus and fails to capture the reader’s imagination, as well as an excess of mediocre writing in need of serious editing.” The sequel *Southern Cross* is described as a failed exercise because all of the characters are stereotypes and the story line is not believable. *Isle of Dogs* fares no better. Readers say, “Don’t Waste Your Time or Money. [...] I was insulted and offended by the characters, their situations and their reactions to each other.” Yet most of these reviewers rated the novels of the Scarpetta series from very good to excellent.

Why were all these readers so upset? According to Jeffrey Richards, “Generic literature [...] functions as a ritual, cementing the ideas and beliefs of society, enforcing social norms and exposing, labelling and isolating social deviants.” This type of literature tends to reproduce the dominant ideology of a period, because it relies on the recycling of the same elements, characters and situations. In the following I will argue that although Cornwell recycles familiar elements in the Garcia series, she does not cement or reinforce social norms. Instead, she questions and subverts the hegemonic structures of power and sexuality in American society. The transition from the Scarpetta series to the Garcia series involves a radicalisation of Cornwell’s fictional worldview. Furthermore, the inversions and subversions of gender in the series parody the gendered assumptions of patriarchal society.

---


2 See Customer Reviews, Nowbooks.biz, for reviews of all three books. [http://www.nowbooks.biz/popular/c/Patricia_Cornwell.html](http://www.nowbooks.biz/popular/c/Patricia_Cornwell.html) (12.02.02).

Convention and Invention

Literary parody involves much more than simple duplication or comparison. It pays homage to accepted literary formulas at the same time as it disrespectfully thumbs its nose at them. In order to recognize and interpret parody, the reader must share certain codes with the author. Parody is thus dependent on intertextuality and the existence of a sophisticated audience who can decode one text in the light of another. The parodist inverts a formula and inverts a world. The final meaning of parody rests therefore on the reader’s ability to recognize the superimposition of one world or text upon another.4

In terms of practitioners, crime fiction has been one of the most gender-integrated literary genres since its inception. However, the genre entered popular literature as an indisputably masculine type of writing. Both culprits and detectives were typically male, and their aggressive manner and role as defender of the powerless expressed attitudes associated with masculine values. Since the plot revolved around the archetypal image of the male hero, stealthy parody has been the inevitable response of women writers who have appropriated and developed the genre. Writers like Agatha Christie and Dorothy L. Sayers began by creating feminised detective heroes like Hercule Poirot and Lord Peter Wimsey. Later they introduced female sleuths and a wider range of female characters into their stories. Like their real counterparts, these fictional female characters challenged and changed sets of assumptions about gender roles in society. In spite of women’s influence on the genre, Sally R. Munt argues that the crime novel continues to be perceived as intrinsically masculine and innately conservative.5 Nevertheless, the evolution and mutations of the crime novel formula, especially in the hands of female writers, show that the crime novel itself is innately parodic.

All art depends upon a constant, dynamic tension between convention and invention. Different schools of crime writers have developed over time to accommodate new values in society, new gender roles, a growing female readership, and the march of women writers and characters into this once so masculine arena. The genre has evolved and mutated into a variety of sub-genres. In this way, new writers have often been able to foreground the gaps and problems inherent within the dominant ideology of their time.

---

Cornwell’s attempts at questioning gender assumptions in the Garcia series is just such a foregrounding, but is not consistent enough to be completely successful.

**The Police Procedural**

Part of the frustration of Cornwell’s erstwhile fans is certainly due to her transition from the fascinating, although grisly realm of the forensic pathologist in her first series to the somewhat more mundane world of the police procedural in the Garcia series. This sub-genre developed alongside the hard-boiled American detective novel of the 1940s. Notable for its realism, the police procedural has developed since then to reflect the changing reality of actual police work. Thus the increasing importance of women in the force has been reflected in the novels of such pioneers as Dorothy Uhnak, demonstrated in *The Bait* (1968) and Lillian O’Donnel in *The Phone Calls* (1972).

The police procedural attempts to portray the realities of police investigations and routine and depends upon police working as a *team*. I would argue that the major grievance of Cornwell’s fans concerns the loss of the familiar, masterful character of Dr. Kay Scarpetta, whose story is told in the first person. In contrast, the Garcia series divides our attention among three members of a team presented in a third person narrative form. In spite of the use of free indirect discourse, which allows us insight into the characters’ minds (and indeed into the minds of Niles the cat and Popeye the dog!) readers have lost a strong heroine with whom they can identify.

As Dean A. Miller explains, we do not find “individual intuitive brilliance […] at the heart of police procedurals.” Instead, we are concerned with “Matching fingerprints; analysing chemical residues, bodily fluids, and other physical evidence; interpreting blood spatter patterns; scrutinizing public records; gathering computer data; using informants.”

The fictional police in police procedurals have to write reports to keep their superiors informed, follow rules of evidence, and obey regulations in order to avoid bureaucratic entanglements. In addition, they have to cope with their private lives on top of a heavy caseload. Hence, there is no place for the exceptional heroine à la Scarpetta. No team could hope to compete with her, regardless of the abilities of its individual members. Cornwell ironically allows Scarpetta a guest appearance in *Isle of Dogs*, when Hammer

---

and Garcia are bungling through a complicated case, perhaps as a gesture to those of her readers who miss their heroine the most.

Another weakness of the Garcia series as police procedurals is due to Cornwell’s choice of characters. Hammer and West both rank highly in the administrative bureaucracy. This means they are not normally involved in the detailed detective work that lower ranking officers take care of, robbing the reader of the pleasure of following the chain of evidence. Andy Garcia is the main reason why the two women are drawn into more active police work. West is forced to “baby-sit” for Andy in his capacity as a journalist by taking on basic patrol duty. Hammer has to make sure his on-the-scene reports do not create public relations problems for her department.

**Gender-bending and Role Reversals**

All three of the Garcia novels are set in the conservative American South, which has been a staunch bastion of patriarchy. As Carey Harrison has pointed out in a review of *Southern Cross*, these books may be police procedurals, but “Cornwell is not afraid to conjure up a cartoon South. At times we’re closer to Dogpatch than the 87th precinct.”\(^7\) Politically, patriarchy “is a social system of rule that insures the dominance of men in the family and state and the subservience of women.”\(^8\) Patriarchy privileges masculine sexuality, is phallocentric and homophobic. Cornwell challenges this hegemonic ideology throughout the Garcia books through gender-bending and role reversals.

The plot of *Hornet’s Nest* opens with a serial killer, known as the “Black Widow”, loose in the streets of Charlotte, North Carolina. At each crime scene, a middle class, male murder victim from out of town is found outside his rented car, robbed, shot in the head, his trousers pulled down to reveal an orange, spray-painted hourglass over his groin and genitals. This image of castration is repeated ad nauseam for each of the killer’s five victims. Ironically, two women, Hammer and West, lead the team responsible for apprehending the Black Widow and restoring the patriarchal order.

The Black Widow spider kills and devours her partner as part of the mating ritual. Although Charlotte’s Black Widow is assumed to be male because of the aggression involved in the murders, the orange hourglass

---


painted on the victims’ genitals suggests that the crimes are sexually motivated. The mayor wants the murders to be characterized as “homophobic” in the media, fearing that people will no longer dare to attend conferences in Charlotte and that the city will lose the patronage of tourists and businessmen. The underlying message is that “straight” men have nothing to fear. The sexual ambiguity involved in the image of the serial murders sets the scene for further investigation into gender roles, power structures and the threat to the symbolic order in the novel.

Those familiar with the hard-boiled detective novel will recognize that Chief Judy Hammer has a famous namesake in the character of Mike Hammer, the detective protagonist of twelve of Mickey Spillane’s twenty-one works. Mike Hammer is a fantasy of irresistible masculine potency who goes about his pursuit of vigilante justice with evangelical zeal. In _I, the Jury_ (1947), this zeal leads him to shoot his own naked fiancée in the stomach when he learns that she is responsible for the death of six people, including his old army buddy. Woman represents an evil menace and temptation in Mike Hammer’s world, and must be subdued at all costs. Spillane’s hero is a fierce avenger and projects social nihilism.

Cornwell’s Judy Hammer is also powerful; she “decided everything that mattered in law enforcement in this hundred-mile area of almost six million people.” (HN, 4) In her early fifties, and “surrounded by framed photographs of babies and grandbabies,” (HN, 4) she is the subject of 22-year old Andy Garcia’s romantic fantasies and desires. In contrast to Mike Hammer, she does not simply seek to punish offenders: her mission statement is “Prevent the Next Crime”. All of this fits in with modern society’s ideas about dynamic, responsible women – women fit to be the heroines of our modern fantasies. Judy Hammer has authority and power, but still manages to come across as both attractive and feminine, and her feminine values inform her role as Chief of Police.

However, like Mike Hammer, the Chief has a troubled relationship with her significant other. Seth, her husband of 26 years and the father of her two sons, is an overweight, “housewife-husband”. “His most significant setback in life was that he had inherited money from his family, and was not obligated to work, was gentle, and tended to be mild, non-violent, and tired much of the time.” (HN, 117) Seth feels neglected by his important, powerful wife. In an attempt to gain her attention, he threatens to commit suicide and accidentally shoots himself, not in the abdomen, but in his backside, with his wife’s unlicensed revolver. Scandalously and ridiculously, he dies of complications from this superficial wound. Traditional gender roles are thus ironically inverted. Seth is given the attributes of the stereotypically passive housewife, while Hammer is portrayed as active,
aggressive and powerful. But whereas Mike Hammer actively punishes evil-doers and pulls the trigger on his wayward woman, Hammer prefers to prevent crimes from happening, if possible. Nevertheless, she is morally, albeit passively, responsible for the death of her husband. She is not a black widow, but a widow with a black conscience.

Deputy Chief Virginia West’s name is an inversion in itself. One irate reviewer who took offence with Cornwell’s use of outlandish, Dickensian names (Butner Fluck IV, Weed Gardener, Unique First, etc.) suggested that she might as well have been called Carolina South. Her surname, however, brings to mind John Creasey’s fictional detective from Scotland Yard, Inspector Roger “Handsome” West. The physical description of West briefly focuses on her attractiveness as a woman:

West was forty-two, a woman who still turned heads and had never been married to anything beyond what she thought she was here on earth to do. She had deep red hair, a little unattended and longer than she liked it, her eyes dark and quick, and a serious body that she did not deserve, for she did nothing to maintain curves and straightness in the right places. She wore her uniform in a way that made other women want one. (HN, 42)

West’s competitiveness, ambition, and aggression, however, are qualities which are usually associated with masculine behaviour. She is a tough, beer-swilling woman who builds everything from wooden fences to bird-houses with her collection of power tools, plays tennis on a men’s team, is a crack shot and manages to outsmart and physically subdue criminals who are twice her size. In short, West is hard-boiled, and has no illusions about the mean streets of Charlotte. In the course of Hornet’s Nest, West surprisingly starts a romantic relationship with the almost twenty year younger Andy Garcia.

Garcia, too, has a namesake, but not from the world of crime literature per se. Cuban-American actor Andy Garcia has spent years playing characters on both sides of the law. One of his first roles was that of a gang member in the 1981 premier episode of the television police series Hill Street Blues. In the 1987 movie The Untouchables he was a rookie cop sharpshooter, and in 1990 he played the role of a benevolent police officer in Internal Affairs, with Richard Gere as his nemesis. Physically, the real Garcia is a handsome, dark Latino heart-throb, in contrast to Cornwell’s

---

10 English author John Creasey (1908–1973) wrote over 500 crime novels. See for example Inspector West Takes Charge (1942).
fair-haired, blue-eyed protagonist. The actor has been described as a “macho softie” because of the schizophrenic split between the macho roles he plays on the screen and his private life. “Andy Garcia won’t take off his T-shirt during sex scenes, and he adores his wife and children,” as one journalist reports.\(^\text{11}\) The fictional Garcia is also a confusing melange of shy, nurturing “nice guy” and testosterone-driven aggression.

Whereas Cornwell’s physical descriptions of her female heroines are relatively short and to the point, there are repeated descriptions of Andy Garcia’s handsome physique: “He was handsome and fierce, with cheekbones high, hair streaked blond, body firm and athletically splendid. He did not seem aware of how others reacted to the sight of him, or perhaps it didn’t matter. Mostly his attention was elsewhere.”(HN, 9) Cornwell describes him running, doing push ups, dripping in sweat. He is idolized by men and women alike; the homosexual reporter Axel swoons for Andy, an unidentified female bombards him with obscene phone calls, and everyone he runs into either envies him his good looks and athletic body or hates him for his perfection. At the same time, he is described as naïve, idealistic and pure. He is convinced of his call as both writer and policeman, on a mission to expose injustice and protect the public. In a sense, he is Kay Scarpetta’s overachieving, male alter-ego.

One of the most prominent feminist film critics since the middle of the 1970s, Laura Mulvey, pointed out that females in Hollywood films often functioned as passive raw material for the active gaze of the male. This “male gaze” constituted a crucial part of traditional filmic pleasure.\(^\text{12}\) The concept of the male gaze was quickly transferred to literary studies. One of the aims of feminist filmmakers and writers has been to shift the emphasis or place of the gaze. They wanted to show the possibility of reversing, varying and exposing it. In *Hornet’s Nest*, Andy Garcia at times becomes the focus of the gaze, but the inversion is not total. He is the subject of both the male and the female gaze, creating ambiguity about sexual relationships.\(^\text{13}\)

\(^\text{13}\) In an article on Cornwell, “A life hardly more ordinary than her fiction” (*The Guardian*, 08.12.01), Fiachra Gibbons points out that Cornwell was “outed as a lesbian in spectacular fashion when her lover, a former FBI agent, exchanged shots with her hus-
The demarcations between the sexes and the fickleness of desire are continually challenged and questioned in the Garcia series. The redneck Bubba, a character in *Hornet’s Nest* who represents an ultra conservative version of the traditional patriarchal worldview, gets in trouble with West and Garcia on the shooting range. After being disarmed and humiliated, he sums up the couple: “Honestly, there was no way a man could look that good or a woman could be that powerful unless they were suspect.” (HN, 131)

In spite of his energy, ambition and talent, Andy is still cast as the inexperienced team member. He is a subaltern without power or status. As a rookie volunteer cop he is assigned mundane duties such as directing traffic, and his powerless status is emphasized by the fact that he is not allowed to carry any weapons. A bystander in a traffic jam wondered, “why [Andy] wasn’t wearing any hardware beyond a whistle. What if he got in a shoot-out?” (HN, 82) Since guns are often perceived as phallic symbols, he is symbolically emasculated. In addition, Andy is described as sensitive and emotional. He falls in love with powerful, older women. This is again a reversal of the traditional pattern in patriarchal society where passive, vulnerable women are attracted to older, powerful males.

As the plot thickens, Garcia gains power and status. West gives him shooting lessons and even lends him one of her police revolvers to use for practice, a gesture suggesting that he partakes of her power and status. She becomes both his mentor and his lover, and their relationship becomes a proving ground of gender assumptions. West says, “Let’s talk about this wife-shit again,” (HN, 125) and Andy romantically claims:

‘There shouldn’t be roles. There should be practicalities, people helping out each other like friends. One week where the other’s strong, people using their gifts, cooking together, playing tennis, fishing. Walking on the beach. Staying up late talking. Being unselfish and caring.’ (HN, 127)

West’s response is short and to the point, “Heard it all before. Seen that rerun.” (HN, 127) Whereas Andy is the sensitive, “new” man with romantic ideals, West is masculinized in terms of lifestyle and sexuality. Their relationship is doomed to failure and falls apart in *Southern Cross*, due to conventional jealousies and misunderstandings.

Cornwell’s character portrayals are scathingly ironic. Her female characters draw on important elements in a traditionally masculine repertoire:

---

band when he turned up at her church to confront her.” This may have been a contributing factor in the radicalization of Cornwell’s fictional world.
aggression, rationality and a focus on their careers which is detrimental to their personal relationships. They become ridiculous because they adopt aspects of masculinity which have traditionally been criticised by feminists. She makes fun of men by parodying Andy’s egocentricity and at times reducing him to a sex object in a game where women have power and control the gaze.

But Andy continually challenges the authority of the two women he works with, endangering both himself and others. Furthermore, he is unable to see the hazards of mixing his roles as police officer and reporter. This, too, complicates investigations and jeopardizes others. In fact, the more active (and thus masculine) he becomes, the more of a menace he becomes to his surroundings. And even though Andy preaches equality of the sexes, his true colours sometimes shine through. In a newspaper article where he reports an incident where West and Hammer managed to disarm a bus hijacker who threatened the lives of many people, he reduces them to caricature:

POLICE CHIEF AND DEPUTY FOIL ABDUCTION OF BUS
BATMAN AND ROBIN IN HEELS? (HN, 177)

**Blurring the Nexus of Good and Evil**
The first practitioners within crime writing prepared the genre for a conservative worldview: “an outlook that linked the solution of crime and the resolution of disorder with the maintenance of social class structures, the protection of property for those who possessed it, and the identification of criminal disorder with social destabilization.”¹⁴ In this original conservative worldview there was a binary opposition between right and wrong, good and evil. It was thus crucial that no matter what mitigating circumstances existed, “the blame for any crime committed within the narrative is laid on the shoulders of its perpetrator and not on society at large.”¹⁵

In the Scarpetta series, the nexus of good and evil is clear. Victims are innocent, and the perpetrator becomes the personification of evil. The character Temple Brooks Gault, for example, comes from a respectable, well to do family in Georgia and has had the privilege of attending a private col-
lege.\textsuperscript{16} He is introduced as a serial killer in \textit{Cruel and Unusual} (1993), and continues his life of crime in \textit{The Body Farm} (1994) and \textit{From Potter’s Field} (1995). The murders he commits are basically random and unmotivated, and he delights in leaving confusing or disturbing evidence behind for the investigators. His pathological personality is a threat to the social order, and there is no evidence that society can be blamed for his deeds. Most of the killers in the Scarpetta series are modelled on a similar psychopathic formula.

In the Garcia series there are two murderers, Smoke and Unique First, who adhere to the type. Both of them are inexplicably and pathologically evil and take great pleasure in inflicting pain on others. Both come from privileged backgrounds and have had parents and families who have supported them and excused them to a fault. But in this series there are shades of grey when it comes to criminal behaviour. Smoke and Unique commit murder without scruples; other characters are unwillingly drawn into their circle as flunkies and slaves. Weed Gardner and Dog have been forced to collude with Smoke in fear for their lives. Cornwell fills in the picture so we feel sympathy for the characters who get sucked into the criminal underworld against their own better instincts and will. Neglected by family and society, they are easy prey for the psychopath seeking power. Characters like Weed, Dog and Butner Fluck IV play a larger role in the Garcia series, and the focus on the killers is toned down, compared to the Scarpetta series. Criminal behaviour is no longer simply blamed on innate evil; social factors and injustice also cause crime.

**DOA?**

For fans looking for more Scarpetta, the Garcia series is bound to be a let-down. Cornwell has departed from her own formula with its triumphant, superhuman heroine to a sub-genre which demands a more realistic worldview. \textit{Hornet’s Nest} starts out with the promise of two powerful heroines rather than one, but the plot exposes them as parodic figures. Although gender roles are questioned and subverted, Andy Garcia surprisingly becomes the main character in the series, while the importance of the strong female characters is reduced. In \textit{Isle of Dogs}, Hammer seems more concerned and upset about her missing dog Popeye than with Richmond’s criminal underworld. Virginia West is no longer part of the team, and we

\textsuperscript{16} Gault attended Davidson College in Davidson, North Carolina, which incidentally is also the Alma Mater of both Cornwell herself and the fictional Andy Garcia.
learn nothing about where she is working. In short, Judy Hammer is Mike Hammer in drag, and Virginia West is more “masculine” than most men. Andy Garcia is presented as emasculated, but power-hungry, and he soon becomes trigger-happy. These inversions and subversions challenge the gendered assumptions of patriarchal society, but they do not make feminism look good. One is tempted to ask whether adopting stereotypically aggressive male behaviour is a prerequisite for power and status.

The transition from the Scarpetta series to the Garcia series also involves a radicalisation of Cornwell’s worldview. We leave Scarpetta’s social circle of academics and experts and enter the lives of working class characters living in “mean streets” reminiscent of hard-boiled detective fiction. This introduces nuances in the nexus of good and evil which are more realistic, in accordance with the conventions of the police procedural. But even though Cornwell focuses more on social injustice as a cause of crime in her new series, she still uses sociopaths like Smoke and Unique as scapegoats to externalise guilt. Furthermore, the transition from the world of the medical examiner to the police procedural means that we have to accept a more open-ended story line. The serial killer was always the major focus of the Scarpetta novels. The culprit was nearly always apprehended and jailed, or “exterminated”. In contrast, police teams fight a never-ending battle against crime and can at best only hope to accomplish a momentary resolution of a criminal problem.

In works of literature with claims to serious attention, Michael Bell argues that “a given worldview is experimentally inhabited, while criticism involves both understanding the worldview and assessing its habitability.” Patricia Cornwell’s Scarpetta series was anchored in the conventions of the crime genre and a conservative worldview. The Garcia series is a new departure with the vestigial beginnings of a radicalised worldview. However, the farcical tone of the new series has confused and disappointed her fans. Her new worldview lacks the consistency needed to make it habitable. Hopefully, with a little thought about her underlying intentions, Cornwell will be able to resuscitate her series.

---